



LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

PORTFOLIO COMMITTEE NO. 3

Budget Estimates 2019-2020



Report 41

May 2020

3

www.parliament.nsw.gov.au

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

Budget Estimates 2019-2020

Ordered to be printed 20 May 2020 according to Standing
Order 231

New South Wales Parliamentary Library cataloguing-in-publication data:

New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education.

Budget Estimates 2019-2020 / Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education [Sydney, N.S.W.] : the Committee, 2020. [x, 27] pages ; 30 cm. (Report no. 41 / Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education)

“May 2020”

Chair: Hon. Mark Latham MLC.

ISBN 9781920788711

1. New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education—Appropriations and expenditures.
 - I. Latham, Mark.
 - II. Title.
 - III. Series: New South Wales. Parliament. Legislative Council. Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education. Report ; no. 41

328.94407 (DDC22)

Table of contents

	Terms of reference	iv
	Committee details	vi
	Chair's foreword	vii
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
	Referral of the Budget Estimates 2019-2020	1
	Hearings	2
	Transcripts, questions on notice and supplementary questions	2
Chapter 2	Issues raised during hearings	3
	Education and Early Childhood Learning	3
	Skills and Tertiary Education	5
Appendix 1	Witnesses at hearings	7
Appendix 2	Minutes	11

Terms of reference

1. That on tabling, the Budget Estimates and related papers for the financial year 2019 – 2020 presenting the amounts to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund be referred to the Portfolio Committees for inquiry and report.
2. That for the purposes of the Budget Estimates inquiry 2019 – 2020:
 - (a) initial hearings be scheduled over 12 days from 29 to 30 August, 2 to 6 September and 9 to 13 September 2019, with the examination of portfolios on those days to be specified by further resolution of the House,
 - (b) supplementary hearings be scheduled over five days from 28 October to 1 November 2019, or on such other dates as required, with the examination of portfolios on those days to be determined by resolution of each committee,¹
 - (c) further hearings be scheduled over 12 days from 2 to 17 March 2020, with the examination of portfolios on those days to be specified by further resolution of the House and the time for giving of evidence by ministers, parliamentary secretaries and officers to be determined by resolution of each committee,²
 - (d) each scheduled day for the initial and further rounds³ of hearings will begin at 9.30 am and conclude by 8.30 pm,⁴
 - (e) the committees must hear evidence in public,
 - (f) the committees may ask for explanations from ministers, parliamentary secretaries or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure,
 - (g) witnesses, including ministers, may not make an opening statement before the committee commences questions,
 - (h) members may lodge supplementary questions with the committee clerk by 5.00 pm within two days, excluding Saturday and Sunday, following a hearing,
 - (i) answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions are to be published, except those answers for which confidentiality is requested, after they have been circulated to committee members, and
 - (j) committees are to present a final report to the House by 30 June 2020.

¹ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 16 October 2019, p 520.

² *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 20 November 2019, p 729.

³ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 16 October 2019, p 520.

⁴ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 20 November 2019, p 729.

3. That this House resolve to adopt a revised schedule for future budget estimates inquiries similar to the Senate estimates process comprised of:
- (a) an initial round of estimates hearings over 12 days on the tabling of the Budget Estimates and related papers,
 - (b) supplementary hearings scheduled over five days in October or November of that year, and
 - (c) further hearings scheduled over 12 days in February or March of the following year.

The terms of reference were referred to the committee by the House on 8 May 2019, and amended on 16 October 2019 and 20 November 2019.⁵

⁵ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 8 May 2019, pp 117-119; 16 October 2019, p 520; 20 November 2019, p 729.

Committee details

Committee members

The Hon Mark Latham MLC	Pauline Hanson's One Nation	<i>Chair</i>
The Hon Matthew Mason-Cox MLC	Liberal Party	<i>Deputy Chair</i>
The Hon Anthony D'Adam MLC	Australian Labor Party	
The Hon Wes Fang MLC	The Nationals	
The Hon Scott Farlow MLC	Liberal Party	
The Hon Courtney Houssos MLC	Australian Labor Party	
Mr David Shoebridge MLC	The Greens	

Non-substantive members who attended the hearings

The Hon Mark Banasiak MLC	Shooters, Fishers and Farmers
Ms Abigail Boyd MLC	The Greens
The Hon Ben Franklin MLC	The Nationals
The Hon Penny Sharpe MLC	Australian Labor Party

Contact details

Website	www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/budgetestimates
Email	Budget.Estimates@parliament.nsw.gov.au
Telephone	(02) 9230 2303

Chair's foreword

I am pleased to present this report on the Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020. This annual inquiry into the Budget Estimates ensures parliamentary oversight of the Budget, and provides an important mechanism for the accountability of the executive government to the Legislative Council.

Portfolio Committee No. 3 is responsible for the scrutiny of the following portfolio areas:

- Education and Early Childhood Learning
- Skills and Tertiary Education.

Parliamentary scrutiny of education spending has never been more important. Governments are spending record amounts on school education but with fast declining results, as witnessed in last year's PISA results for NSW. The pandemic crisis has diverted attention from the need for comprehensive education reform in NSW but the contents of this Estimates report is a useful reminder of the issues and urgency at stake.

The key evidence gathering mechanism of this Inquiry is through the conduct of public hearings. This report lists the key issues raised during the hearings. Transcripts, tabled documents and additional answers provided after the hearings are published on the [Inquiry's webpage](#).

On behalf of the committee, I would like to thank the ministers and their officers who assisted the committee during this important inquiry. I am grateful to my fellow committee members and the secretariat staff for their contributions to the inquiry process.



Hon Mark Latham MLC

Chair

Chapter 1 Introduction

The Inquiry into Budget Estimates is one of the key mechanisms for parliamentary committees to scrutinise government expenditure, performance and effectiveness. It holds ministers and government officials to account and provides a greater level of transparency to the public.

The Inquiry is conducted annually by the Legislative Council's Portfolio Committees. Each committee examines the budget estimates of its responsible portfolios, with ministers and senior public servants as the primary witnesses. The evidence taking process of the Inquiry consists of answers provided during public hearings and answers to post-hearing written questions (known as supplementary questions). There is no provision for written submissions.

Referral of the Budget Estimates 2019-2020

- 1.1** The Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 ('the Inquiry') was referred to the portfolio committees on 8 May 2019 by the Legislative Council.⁶ The budget estimates resolution establishing the Inquiry and that sets out the rules for the Inquiry is reproduced on page iv and v.
- 1.2** The budget estimates resolution this year had significant procedural changes compared to previous years. The amount of time for questioning for each portfolio area was significantly increased, and the duration of the whole inquiry across all the portfolio committees was 12 days, compared to previous years of five. The variations to the conduct of the Inquiry are outlined below.

Total hearing time for questioning

- 1.3** The resolution authorised the committees to conduct three rounds of hearings: initial, supplementary and further hearings, from 9.30 am to 8.30 pm, to examine all portfolios for each minister.
- 1.4** The total amount of time available for scrutiny was nearly tripled compared to previous estimates inquiries. In the past, only two rounds of hearings (initial and supplementary) were conducted and portfolios under the same minister were examined for under four hours duration. That meant that Ministers and senior public servants could generally face a maximum of eight hours of questioning over two budget estimates hearings. In contrast, under the new resolution Ministers and senior public servants could face potentially up to 33 hours of questioning over three different hearings.
- 1.5** On 16 October 2019, the House amended the resolution to require only initial and further rounds of the hearings to begin at 9.30 am and conclude by 8.30 pm. The committees were therefore able to determine when and how much time was required for supplementary hearings, if any.⁷

⁶ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 8 May 2019, pp 117-119.

⁷ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 16 October 2019, p 520.

Witnesses

- 1.6 The resolution required ministers, parliamentary secretaries or officers of departments, statutory bodies or corporations, relating to the items of proposed expenditure, to appear in the morning session, and only officers giving further evidence during the afternoon session.⁸ It is noted that parliamentary secretaries were not required to give evidence to earlier estimates inquiries.
- 1.7 On 20 November 2019, the resolution was further amended so that, for the further hearings, each committee could determine who (ministers, parliamentary secretaries, public servants, or representatives from statutory bodies) they wanted to call and for how long they were to appear within the parameters of 9.30am to 8.30pm.⁹

Number of hearings

- 1.8 The Budget Estimates resolution, as amended, stipulated that the initial hearings be held between 29 August and 13 September 2019, supplementary hearings from 28 October to 1 November 2019, and further hearings from 2 to 17 March 2019.¹⁰

Hearings

- 1.9 The committee held 4 public hearings as follows:
- Wednesday 4 September 2019 – Education and Early Childhood Learning
 - Friday 6 September 2019 – Skills and Tertiary Education
 - Tuesday 3 March 2020 – Education and Early Childhood Learning (further hearing)
 - Wednesday 11 March 2020 – Skills and Tertiary Education (further hearing).

Transcripts, questions on notice and supplementary questions

- 1.10 Transcripts of the hearings, questions taken on notice, supplementary questions and answers to these questions are available on the Budget Estimates web page at: www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/budgetestimates.

⁸ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 8 May 2019, pp 117-119.

⁹ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 20 November 2019, pp 117-119.

¹⁰ *Minutes*, NSW Legislative Council, 20 November 2019, pp 117-119.

Chapter 2 Issues raised during hearings

This chapter provides a brief summary of key issues raised during the hearings.

Education and Early Childhood Learning

2.1 A hearing examining the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning was held on Wednesday 4 September 2019. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of this portfolio:

- Maintenance backlog in schools
- Asbestos management and removal
- Demountable school buildings and the development and/or building standards in schools in relation to facilities, demountables and greenspace
- Support for students with a disability and data on children with disabilities and individualised learning plans
- Management of complaints against teachers
- Tedeschi Review of the Employee Performance and Conduct Directorate (EPAC)
- School counsellors and psychologists
- Pay inequity for teachers and negotiation of new Award
- NAPLAN testing and measurement of educational outcomes
- Before and after school care facilities
- Local school local decision making model and funding
- School Enrolment policy, including criteria for out-of-area enrolments
- The Principal improvement program
- Notifiable incidents in family day care centres
- Inner Sydney High School
- Special Religious Education, data collection and policy
- People Matters Survey
- School targets
- IT Issues with NAPLAN in 2019
- Statement of Equity Principles.

2.2 A further hearing examining the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning was held on Tuesday 3 March 2020. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of this portfolio:

- Changes to the Local Schools, Local Decisions policy

- RAM funding
- Coronavirus impact on schools, and school cleaning contracts
- Academic results of students
- School excellence frameworks
- Rebranding
- Learning Management and Business Reform
- School counsellors and support after the bushfires
- Play space in schools
- Asbestos and schools and remediation
- Bump it Up program
- Air quality in schools after bushfires and Cooler Classrooms policy
- Workforce profile
- New before and after schools care services
- Safety of children in child care services
- Australian Children's Education and Care Quality framework
- Preschools
- Design of some new schools
- Suspension rates of students with ADHD
- Expenses to date on new school projects and sites, including Olympic Park, Marsden Park, Pendle Hill, Wentworthville, Alexandria Park
- Department of Education's diversity and inclusion strategy
- EPAC's handling of complaints, investigations etc
- Support for students with disability, NDIS packages, out of home care support
- Medical retirement of teachers for psychological reasons
- Revised enrolment policy and new factors included
- Suspension rates of students more generally
- Deficiencies in NESA as identified in the Auditor General's report
- Accreditation of teachers as instructional leaders, highly accomplished, lead teachers etc by NESA.

Skills and Tertiary Education

2.3 A hearing examining the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education was held on Friday 6 September 2019. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of this portfolio:

- Skills shortages and the use of Temporary Skill Shortage visas
- Outcomes based funding in TAFE and the effectiveness of the 'market-driven' approach in identifying what TAFE courses require more government investment
- Establishment of new Connected Learning Centres and whether virtual reality learning is commensurate with face-to-face classroom time
- Most appropriate way to undertake risk assessment and audit of the TAFE system
- Availability of accessible and affordable vocational education and training in rural and remote areas
- Quality of training in TAFE building skill courses in light of the problems evident in the building industry
- Ways to minimise attrition rates in TAFE courses and ensure that more students complete their training
- Query into possible financial incentives to pass students that have not demonstrated competency
- Increases in the number of WHS claims by TAFE students and employees and the adequacy of the response by management.
- Regulation of registered training providers
- Potential sale of TAFE sites and infrastructure planning for TAFE assets
- Students with a disability and supports
- Scholarships for TAFE students
- Numbers of international students
- Interface between schools, vocational education and universities
- Tertiary education facilities in regional areas
- Casual and insecure employment in tertiary education
- University governance.

2.4 A further hearing examining the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education was held on Wednesday 11 March 2020. The following issues were raised during the committee's examination of this portfolio:

- Impact of Covid-19 on the TAFE system
- TAFE courses in bushfire affected communities
- Number of overseas students in the TAFE system

- Shergold and Gonski review of TAFE
- Plans for outcome based funding in the TAFE system
- Appointment of Mr Steffen Faurby as Managing Director of TAFE
- Students with disabilities enrolled in TAFE
- Location and number of student central hubs/customer access centres across the TAFE NSW network
- Number of voluntary redundancies offered by TAFE NSW and permanent employee numbers dating back to 2018
- Incident report levels at TAFE NSW and employee use rates of the employee assistance program
- Status of the learning and management business reform IT project and expected completion date
- Organisational leadership at TAFE NSW and the turnover in CEOs and other executive staff
- The capacity of the TAFE NSW IT infrastructure to service students remotely during the COVID-19 pandemic should campuses have to be closed.

Appendix 1 Witnesses at hearings

Education and Early Childhood Learning – Wednesday 4 September 2019

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC	Minister for Education and Early Childhood Education Learning
Mr Kevin Conolly MP	Parliamentary Secretary for Education
Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education
Mr Murat Dizdar	Deputy Secretary, School Operations and Performance, Department of Education
Ms Georgina Harrisson	Deputy Secretary, Educational Services, Department of Education
Ms Leslie Loble	Deputy Secretary, Education Futures and Governance, Department of Education
Mr Peter Riordan	Deputy Secretary, Corporate Services, Department of Education
Ms Deidre Mulkerin	Deputy Secretary of People and Culture, Department of Education
Mr Erik Maranik	Chief Operating Officer, Schools Infrastructure NSW, Department of Education
Mr Paul Martin	A/Chief Executive Officer, NSW Education Standards Authority
Mr David Murphy	Executive Director, Corporate Governance and School Standards, NSW Education Standards Authority
Ms Tracy Mackey	Executive Director, Early Childhood Education and Care, Department of Education

Skills and Tertiary Education – Friday 6 September 2019

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP	Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education
Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education

Ms Mary Ann O'Loughlin	Deputy Secretary, Skills and Higher Education, Department of Education
Ms Kerry Penton	A/Managing Director, TAFE NSW

Education and Early Childhood Learning – Tuesday 3 March 2020 (further hearing)

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC	Minister for Education and Early Childhood Education Learning
Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education
Mr Murat Dizdar	Deputy Secretary, School Operations and Performance, Department of Education
Ms Georgina Harrison	Deputy Secretary, Educational Services, Department of Education
Ms Liana Downey	Deputy Secretary, Strategy and Delivery, Department of Education
Ms Sally Egan	A/Executive Director, Centre for Education Statistics and Evaluation, Department of Education
Mr Peter Riordan	Deputy Secretary, Corporate Services, Department of Education
Mr Martin Graham	A/Executive Director, Early Childhood Education, Department of Education
Ms Marnie O'Brien	Executive Director, Health and Safety, Department of Education
Mr Paul Martin	A/Chief Executive Officer, NSW Education Standards Authority
Mr David Murphy	Executive Director, Corporate Governance and School Standards, NSW Education Standards Authority
Mr Anthony Manning	Chief Executive, School Infrastructure NSW
Mr Terry Stevens	Executive Director, Asset Management, School Infrastructure NSW

Skills and Tertiary Education – Wednesday 11 March 2020 (further hearing)

Name	Position and Organisation
The Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP	Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education
Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education
Ms Mary Ann O'Loughlin	Deputy Secretary, Skills and Higher Education, Department of Education
Mr Steffen Faurby	Managing Director, TAFE NSW
Ms Kerry Penton	A/Chief Delivery Officer, TAFE NSW
Ms Catherine Grummer	A/Chief Strategy, People and Change Officer, TAFE NSW

Appendix 2 Minutes

Minutes no. 2

Friday 21 June 2019

Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education

Room 1136, Parliament House, Sydney, 10.01 am

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair*

Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Farlow

Mr Franklin (substituting for Mr Fang)

Mrs Houssos

Mr Shoebridge

2. Previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Farlow: That draft minutes no. 1 be confirmed.

3. ***

4. ***

5. ***

6. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – procedural resolutions

The committee noted that the Budget Estimates timetable for 2019-2020 was agreed to by the House. Below is a table of Portfolio Committee No. 3 hearings:

Date	Time	Portfolio
Wednesday 4 September 2019	9.30 am – 12.30 pm 2.00 pm – 5.00 pm 6.00 pm – 8.30 pm	Education and Early Childhood Learning (Mitchell)
Friday 6 September 2019	9.30 am – 12.30 pm 2.00 pm – 5.00 pm 6.00 pm – 8.30 pm	Skills and Tertiary Education (Lee)

6.1 Allocation of question time

The committee noted that under the resolution establishing the Portfolio Committees, the sequence of questions at hearings is to alternate between opposition, crossbench and government members, with equal time allocated to each, unless the committee decides otherwise.

6.2 Order for examination of portfolios

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That consideration of the order for examination of portfolios be postponed until a future meeting.

6.3 Witness requests

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That the secretariat write to the ministers named in the budget estimates resolution to request that they nominate witnesses to appear at each estimates hearing, for the committee's resolution.

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That the committee consider whether to invite parliamentary secretaries to appear at the budget estimates hearings at a future meeting.

7. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 11.37 am, until Wednesday 3 July 2019 at 10.00 am (*committee meeting*).

Madeleine Foley

Committee Clerk

Minutes no. 4

Wednesday 7 July 2019

Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education

Parkes Room, Parliament House, Sydney, 6.01 pm

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Farlow

Mr Fang

Mrs Houssos

2. Apologies

Mr Mason-Cox

Mr Shoebridge

3. Previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That draft minutes no. 3 be confirmed.

4. Correspondence

The Committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received

- ***
- 25 July 2019 – Email from Mr Cameron Dungar, Advisor, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, to the secretariat, providing a witness list for the Budget Estimates initial hearings.
- 26 July 2019 – Email from Mr Ben Turner, Senior Advisor, Office of the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, to the secretariat, providing a witness list for the Budget Estimates initial hearings.

Sent

- 28 June 2019 – Letter from the secretariat to the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, inviting the Minister to Budget Estimates initial hearings
- 28 June 2019 – Letter from the secretariat to the Hon Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, inviting the Minister to Budget Estimates initial hearings.

5. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – procedural resolutions

5.1 Government questions

The committee deferred consideration of government questions until a future meeting.

5.2 Order for examination of portfolios and witnesses

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That witnesses proposed to answer questions relating to the portfolios allocated to the following ministers be invited to appear for the duration of each session:

- Minister Mitchell on Wednesday 4 September 2019
- Minister Lee on Friday 6 September 2019.

5.3 Additional witness requests

The committee noted each minister's list of proposed witnesses, as per the table below, and that members have until 6.30 pm Thursday 8 August 2019 to provide any additional witness requests.

Resolved on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That Tracey Mackey, Executive Director, Early Childhood Education and Care, Department of Education be invited to appear at the Education and Early Childhood Education Learning hearing.

5.4 Parliamentary secretaries

Resolved, on motion of Mr D'Adam: That the committee invite Mr Kevin Connolly MP, Parliamentary Secretary for Education to appear at the Education and Early Childhood Education Learning hearing.

Minister	Portfolio	Witness	Position and Department
Mitchell	Education and Early Childhood Education Learning	Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education
		Mr Murat Dizdar	Deputy Secretary, School Operations and Performance, Department of Education
		Ms Georgina Harrisson	Deputy Secretary, Educational Services, Department of Education
		Ms Leslie Loble	Deputy Secretary, External Affairs and Regulation, Department of Education
		Mr Peter Riordan	Deputy Secretary, Corporate Services, Department of Education
		Mr Anthony Manning	Chief Executive, School Infrastructure NSW, Department of Education
		Mr Paul Martin	A/Chief Executive Officer, NSW Education Standards Authority
		Mr David Murphy	Executive Director, Corporate Governance and School Standards, NSW Education Standards Authority
Lee	Skills and Tertiary Education	Mr Mark Scott	Secretary, Department of Education
		Ms Mary Ann O'Loughlin	Deputy Secretary, Skills and Higher Education, Department of Education
		Ms Kerry Penton	A/Managing Director, TAFE NSW

6. ***

7. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 6.06 pm, *sine die*.

Jenelle Moore
Clerk to the Committee

Minutes no. 6

Wednesday 4 September 2019

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

Jubilee Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 9.20 am

1. Members presentMr Latham, *Chair*Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Ms Boyd (substituting for Mr Shoebridge for parts of the meeting)

Mr Banasiak (*participating*)

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow

Mrs Houssos

Mr Shoebridge

2. Previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That draft minutes no. 5 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received

- 13 August 2019 - Email from Mr Rick Cortese, Senior Electorate Officer, Office of the Mr Kevin Conolly MP, Parliamentary Secretary for Education, advising that Mr Conolly will attend the Budget Estimates hearing for Education and Early Childhood Learning on 4 September 2019
- 14 August 2019 – Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Officer, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, to the secretariat, confirming Ms Tracey Mackey, Executive Director, Early Childhood Education and Care, Department of Education will attend the Education and Early Childhood Learning Budget Estimates hearing on 4 September 2019
- ***

Sent

- 12 August 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Mr Ben Turner, Senior Advisor, Office of the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, confirming that the committee has not requested additional witnesses for Budget Estimates
- 12 August 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Mr Cameron Dunger, Advisor, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, providing an additional witness request for Budget Estimates
- 13 August 2019 – Letter from the secretariat to Mr Kevin Conolly MP, Parliamentary Secretary for Education, inviting the Parliamentary Secretary to the Budget Estimates Education and Early Childhood Learning hearing on 4 September 2019.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020

Mr D'Adam declared an interest relevant to the education portfolio, for which he had received advice from the Clerk that this interest would not preclude him from participating in proceedings.

4.1 Government questions

Resolved on the motion of Mr Farlow: That with no questions asked by government members, the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning be examined from 9.30 am to 11.30 am, 2.00 pm to 5.00 pm, and 6.00 pm to 7.00 pm (if required).

4.2 Allocation of questioning

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That for the each session:

- the opposition and crossbench be allocated 20 minutes of questioning each round, and any time remaining be divided between the two groups equally
- Mr Banasiak be allocated 5 mins from the cross bench time (except in the last round of questioning).

4.3 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – Education and Early Childhood Learning

Witnesses, the public and the media were admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning was admitted.

Mr Kevin Conolly MP, Parliamentary Secretary for Education was admitted.

The following witnesses were sworn:

- Mr Mark Scott, Secretary, Department of Education
- Mr Murat Dizdar, Deputy Secretary, School Operations and Performance, Department of Education
- Ms Georgina Harrisson, Deputy Secretary, Educational Services, Department of Education
- Ms Leslie Loble, Deputy Secretary, Education Futures and Governance, Department of Education
- Mr Peter Riordan, Deputy Secretary, Corporate Services, Department of Education
- Mr Erik Maranik, Chief Operating Officer, Schools Infrastructure NSW, Department of Education
- Mr Paul Martin, A/Chief Executive Officer, NSW Education Standards Authority
- Mr David Murphy, Executive Director, Corporate Governance and School Standards, NSW Education Standards Authority
- Ms Tracy Mackey, Executive Director, Early Childhood Education and Care, Department of Education
- Ms Deidre Mulkerin, Deputy Secretary, People and Culture, Department of Education.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

Mr Banasiak tabled a collection of documents related to complaints and investigations of workplace issues in the NSW Department of Education.

The Minister and Parliamentary Secretary withdrew at 11.30 am.

The hearing continued

4.4 Tended documents

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the following documents tendered during the Education and Early Childhood Learning hearing held on Wednesday 4 September 2019, remain confidential

- Collection of documents related to complaints and investigations of workplace issues in the NSW Department of Education, tendered by Mr Banasiak.

4.5 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the committee hold a further meeting to deliberate on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning on a date to be determined following receipt of answers to questions on notice.

4.6 Allocation of questioning for the evening session

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the evening session be held from 6.00-7.15pm and that the allocation of questions be as follows:

- the opposition and crossbench be allocated 15 minutes of questioning each round, and Mr Banasiak be allocated 5 minutes.

4.7 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – Education and Early Childhood Learning (evening session)

Witnesses, the public and the media were admitted.

The hearing continued

The witnesses withdrew

The public and media withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 7.13 pm.

4.8 Hearing on 6 September 2019

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That with no government questions, the hearing on the morning of Friday 6 September 2019 for the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education be held from 9.30 am – 11.30 am.

5. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 7.18pm, until 9.15 am, Friday 6 September 2019, Macquarie Room (*Skills and Tertiary Education*).

Tina Higgins/Beverly Duffy

Committee Clerk

Minutes no. 7

Friday 6 September 2019

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 9.16 am

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair* (from 9.18 am)

Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow

Mrs Houssos

Mr Shoebridge

2. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received

- 2 September 2019 – Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Officer, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, requesting that Mr Erik Maranik, Chief Operating Officer, Schools Infrastructure NSW, replace Mr Anthony Manning, Chief Executive as Mr Manning is on compassionate leave
- 3 September 2019 – Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Officer, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning to the secretariat, confirming that Ms Deidre Mulkerin is available to attend the Budget Estimates hearing.

Sent

- 2 September 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Officer, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, requesting that Ms Deidre Mulkerin, Deputy Secretary People and Culture, Department of Education appear at the Budget Estimates hearing.

3. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020

3.1 Government questions and the allocation of questioning

Resolved on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education be examined in the morning session from 9.30 am to 11.30 am, with no government questions, and the opposition and cross bench be allocated 20 minutes of questioning each and any time remaining divided evenly.

Resolved on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education be examined in the afternoon sessions as follows:

- from 2.00 pm to 5.00 pm, with no government questions, and the opposition and cross bench allocated 20 minutes of questioning each and any time remaining divided evenly
- that witnesses be advised that they will not be required to attend the hearing scheduled at 6.00 pm today.

3.2 Public hearing: Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – Skills and Tertiary Education

Witnesses, the public and the media were admitted.

The Hon Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education was admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The Chair also reminded Mr Mark Scott, Secretary of the Department of Education that he did not need to be sworn, as he had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing for the same committee.

The following witnesses were sworn:

- Ms Mary Ann O'Loughlin, Deputy Secretary, Skills and Higher Education, Department of Education
- Ms Kerry Penton, A/Managing Director, TAFE NSW.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The Minister withdrew at 11.32 am.

The public hearing continued.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 4.28 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

3.3 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the committee defer its decision on whether to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education, until after the return of answers to supplementary questions.

4. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 6:00 pm, sine die.

Alex Stedman and Madeleine Foley

Committee Clerks

Minutes no. 11

Wednesday 16 October 2019

Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education

Parkes Room, Parliament House, 1.40 pm

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair*

Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow

Mrs Houssos

Mr Shoebridge

2. Draft minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Farlow: That draft minutes nos. 6 and 7 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- 30 September 2019 – Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Office, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, to the secretariat, providing an updated version of answers to questions on notice

Sent:

- 9 September 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Office, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, attaching transcript of evidence with questions on notice highlighted, supplementary questions and instructions on how to correct the transcript and return answers to questions
- 12 September 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Mr Mitchell Potts, Senior Advisor, Office of the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, attaching transcript of evidence with

questions on notice highlighted, supplementary questions and instructions on how to correct the transcript and return answers to questions.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020

4.1 Answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions

The committee noted the following answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions were published by the committee clerk under the authorisation of the resolution appointing the committee:

- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, received 30 September 2019
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from Hon Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, received 2 October 2019.

4.2 Supplementary hearings

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That the committee write to the Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning to request further information in relation to certain questions on notice and supplementary questions from the round of initial hearings, and that:

- committee members be required to identify questions requiring further information by Friday 1 November 2019
- further answers be required by Friday 15 November 2019
- the Minister be informed of the committee's expectation that full and informative answers will be provided, otherwise the committee will consider holding a supplementary hearing in late November/early December to ask questions on the matters raised.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Farlow: That the committee hold no supplementary hearings to consider matters relating to the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education.

5. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 1. 55 pm until 7.45 am, Friday 25 October 2019 (outcome-based funding site visit).

Madeleine Foley
Committee Clerk

Minutes no. 15

Thursday 6 February 2020

Portfolio Committee No. 3 – Education

McKell Room, Parliament House, Sydney at 10.04 am

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair*

Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow (from 10.06 am)

Mrs Houssos (until 1.57 pm)

Mr Shoebridge (until 1.00 pm, then from 1.54 pm)

2. Previous minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr D'Adam: That draft minutes nos. 11 and 14 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The Committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received

- 15 November 2019 – Letter from the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning to the secretariat, attaching answers to the request for further information regarding certain answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from the initial Budget Estimates hearing
- ***

Sent

- 21 October 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Mr Mitchell Potts, Office of the Hon Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, advising that Portfolio Committee No. 3 resolved not to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Skills and Tertiary Education
- 21 October 2019 – Email from the secretariat to Ms Shannon Hall, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, advising that Portfolio Committee No. 3 resolved not to hold supplementary hearings for the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning in the week set aside for supplementary hearings, and that the committee will write to the Minister seeking further information on certain answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions before considering a supplementary hearing in late November/early December
- 4 November 2019 – Letter from the secretariat, to the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, requesting further information regarding certain answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from the initial Budget Estimates hearing
- ***

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – procedural resolutions – further hearings

The 2019-2020 Budget Estimates timetable for further hearings was agreed to by the House. Below is a table of Portfolio Committee No. 3 hearings:

Date	Portfolio
Tuesday 3 March 2020	Education and Early Childhood Education (Mitchell)
Wednesday 11 March 2020	Tertiary Education and Skills (Lee)

4.1 Total hearing time

Mr Fang moved: That

- the portfolios of Education and Early Childhood Education be examined concurrently,
- depending on whether questions will be asked by government members, the total hearing time for the portfolios of Education and Early Childhood Education be as follows:

With Government questions <i>(Equal question time allocated to opposition, crossbench and government members)</i>		Without Government questions <i>(Equal question time allocated to opposition and crossbench)</i>	
9.30am–12.30 pm	Minister appearing	9.30am–11.30 am	Minister appearing
		11.30am–11.40am	Break
		11.40am–12.40pm	Departmental staff
12.30pm–2.00pm	Lunch	12.40 pm–1.40 pm	Lunch
2.00pm–5.00pm	Departmental staff	1.40pm–2.40pm	Departmental staff
		2.40pm–2.50pm	Break

		2.50pm-4.20pm	Departmental staff
		4.20pm	Departmental staff
5.00pm-6.00pm	Dinner		
6.00pm-8.00pm	Departmental staff		

Mr Shoebridge moved: That the hearing allocation be amended so that where questions by government members are not asked, an evening session between 6-8pm be held with questions allocated equally between opposition and cross bench members.

Motion of Mr Shoebridge negatived.

Original motion put and passed.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Fang: That depending on whether questions will be asked by government members, the total hearing time for the portfolios of Tertiary Education and Skills be as follows:

With Government questions <i>(Equal question time allocated to opposition, crossbench and government members)</i>		Without Government questions <i>(Equal question time allocated to opposition and crossbench)</i>	
9.30am-12.30 pm	Minister	9.30am-11.30 am	Minister
		11.30am-11.40am	Break
		11.40am-12.40pm	Departmental staff
12.30pm-2.00pm	Lunch	12.40 pm-1.40 pm	Lunch
2.00pm-5.00pm	Departmental staff	1.40pm-2.40pm	Departmental staff
		2.40pm-2.50pm	Break
		2.50pm-4.20pm	Departmental staff
5.00pm-6.00pm	Dinner		
6.00pm-8.00pm	Departmental staff		

4.2 Allocation of question time

The committee noted that under the resolution establishing the Portfolio Committees, the sequence of questions at hearings is to alternate between opposition, crossbench and government members, with equal time allocated to each, unless the committee decides otherwise.

4.3 Witness requests

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Fang: That committee members email the Secretariat the list of witnesses requested by 5.00 pm, Thursday 6 February 2020.

5. ***

6. ***

7. ***

8. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 2.54 pm until 10am, Thursday 13 February 2020, McKell Room (*Outcome based funding report deliberative*)

Emma Rogerson
Committee Clerk

Minutes no. 17

Tuesday 3 March 2020

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 9.15 am

1. Members presentMr Latham, *Chair*Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair (until 12.40 pm, from 2.31 pm)*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang *(until 3.28 pm)*Mr Farlow *(until 2.32 pm, from 3.28 pm)*

Mrs Houssos

Mr Shoebridge *(until 2.14 pm, from 2.33 pm to 3.07pm, from 3.18 pm)*Mr Banasiak *(participating until 12.40 pm, from 1.43 pm)*Ms Sharpe *(participating from 1.58 pm to 3.01 pm)***2. Previous minutes**

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That draft minutes no. 16 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

The committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received

- 13 February 2020 - Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Childhood Learning to secretariat, confirming the list of witnesses attending the Budget Estimates further hearing for Education and Early Childhood Learning portfolios
- 14 February 2020 - Email from Mr Mitchell Potts, Office of the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education to secretariat, confirming the list of witnesses attending the Budget Estimates further hearing for Skills and Tertiary Education portfolios
- 19 February 2020 - Email from Ms Shannon Hall, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Childhood Learning to secretariat, advising that Professor Peter Shergold AC is unavailable to attend the Budget Estimates further hearing for Education and Early Childhood Learning portfolios.

Sent

- 11 February 2020 - Email from the secretariat to Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, inviting the Minister and departmental witnesses to attend the Budget Estimates further hearing for the Education and Early Childhood Learning portfolios
- 11 February 2020 - Email from the secretariat to Hon Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, inviting the Minister and departmental witnesses to attend the Budget Estimates further hearing for Skills and Tertiary Education portfolios.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – further hearings**4.1 Order for examination of portfolios**

Given that no questions were to be asked by government members, the Committee noted that it had been previously resolved that the portfolios of Education and Early Childhood Learning were to be examined from 9.30 am to 11.30 am with the Minister, then with departmental witnesses from 11.40 am to 12.40 pm and 1.40 pm to 4.20 pm with a ten minute break from 2.40 pm to 2.50 pm.

Ms Houssos moved: That the portfolios of Education and Early Childhood Learning be examined from 9.30 am to 12.30 pm, with the first two and a half hours reserved for questioning by the Opposition and cross bench, and from 2.00 pm to 5.30 pm, with the first three hours of the afternoon session reserved for

questioning by the Opposition and cross bench and the last half an hour of each session reserved for Government questions.

Question put.

The committee divided.

Ayes: Mr D'Adam, Ms Houssos, Mr Shoebridge

Noes: Mr Fang, Mr Farlow, Mr Latham, Mr Mason-Cox

Question resolved in the negative.

4.2 Allocation of question time

The committee noted that under the resolution establishing the Portfolio Committees, the sequence of questions at hearings is to alternate between opposition, crossbench and government members, with equal time allocated to each, unless the committee decides otherwise.

4.3 Public hearing: Education and Early Childhood Learning

Witnesses, the public and the media were admitted.

The Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, was admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The Chair also reminded the following witnesses that they did not need to be sworn, as they had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing for the same committee:

- Mr Mark Scott, Secretary, Department of Education
- Mr Murat Dizdar, Deputy Secretary, School Operations and Performance, Department of Education
- Ms Georgina Harrison, Deputy Secretary, Education Services, Department of Education
- Mr Peter Riordan, Deputy Secretary, Corporate Services, Department of Education
- Mr Paul Martin, A/Chief Executive Officer, NSW Education Standards Authority
- Mr David Murphy, Executive Director, Corporate Governance and School Standards, NSW Education Standards Authority.

The following witnesses were sworn:

- Ms Liana Downey, Deputy Secretary, Strategy & Delivery, Department of Education
- Ms Sally Egan, A/Executive Director, Centre for Education Statistics & Evaluation, Department of Education
- Mr Martin Graham, A/Executive Director, Early Childhood Education, Department of Education
- Ms Marnie O'Brien, Executive Director, Health and Safety, Department of Education
- Mr Anthony Manning, Chief Executive, School Infrastructure NSW
- Mr Terry Stevens, Executive Director, Asset Management, School Infrastructure NSW.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of Education and Early Childhood Education Learning open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The Chair made a ruling about the division of crossbench question time.

Witnesses, the media and public withdrew.

4.4 Committee deliberative

Mr Shoebridge dissented from the Chair's ruling.

The committee deliberated.

The Chair's ruling was withdrawn and Mr Shoebridge's dissenting motion was withdrawn.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Mason-Cox: That the time taken to deliberate is excluded from the balance of the time allocated for the remaining session.

4.5 Public hearing: Education and Early Childhood Learning (continued)

Witnesses, the public and media were re-admitted.

The Minister withdrew at 11.56 am.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 4.17 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

4.6 Lodgement of supplementary questions

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That further to the resolution of the House, members may lodge supplementary questions with the committee clerk by 5.00 pm within two days, except Saturday and Sunday, of the day of receipt of the transcript of a hearing.

5. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 4.18 pm, until 9.15 am, Wednesday 11 March 2020, Macquarie Room, Budget Estimates hearing (*Skills and Tertiary Education*).

Tina Higgins/Emma Rogerson

Committee Clerk

Minutes no. 18

Wednesday 11 March 2020

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

Macquarie Room, Parliament House, Sydney, at 9.15 am

1. Members present

Mr Latham, *Chair*

Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair (until 12.30 pm, and from 2.19 pm)*

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow (*until 12.30 pm*)

Mrs Houssos

Ms Sharpe (*substituting for Mr D'Adam, until 12.30 pm*)

Mr Shoebridge (*until 10.56 am, and from 11.22 am*)

2. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020 – further hearings

2.1 Order for examination of portfolios

Given that no questions were to be asked by government members, the Committee noted that it had been previously resolved that the portfolios of Skills and Tertiary Education were to be examined from 9.30 am to 11.30 am with the Minister, then with departmental witnesses from 11.40 am to 12.40 pm, 1.40 pm to 4.20 pm with a ten minute break from 2.40 pm to 2.50 pm.

2.2 Allocation of question time

The committee noted that under the resolution establishing the Portfolio Committees, the sequence of questions at hearings is to alternate between opposition, crossbench and government members, with equal time allocated to each, unless the committee decides otherwise.

2.3 Public hearing: Skills and Tertiary Education

Witnesses, the public and the media were admitted.

The Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, was admitted.

The Chair made an opening statement regarding the broadcasting of proceedings and other matters. The Chair noted that members of Parliament swear an oath to their office, and therefore do not need to be sworn prior to giving evidence before a committee.

The Chair also reminded the following witnesses that they did not need to be sworn, as they had been sworn at another Budget Estimates hearing for the same committee:

- Mr Mark Scott, Secretary, Department of Education
- Ms Mary Ann O'Loughlin, Deputy Secretary, Skills and Higher Education, Department of Education
- Ms Kerry Penton, A/Chief Delivery Officer, TAFE NSW.

The following witnesses were sworn:

- Mr Steffen Faurby, Managing Director, TAFE NSW
- Ms Catherine Grummer, A/Chief Strategy, People & Change Officer, TAFE NSW.

The Chair declared the proposed expenditure for the portfolios of Skills and Tertiary Education open for examination.

The Minister and departmental witnesses were examined by the committee.

The Minister withdrew at 11.30 am.

The evidence concluded and the witnesses withdrew.

The public hearing concluded at 2.32 pm.

The public and media withdrew.

3. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 2.32 pm, *sine die*.

Beverly Duffy/Alex Stedman
Committee Clerk

Draft minutes no. 19

Monday 11 May 2020

Portfolio Committee No. 3 - Education

via Webex, at 1.00 pm

1. Members presentMr Latham, *Chair*Mr Mason-Cox, *Deputy Chair*

Mr D'Adam

Mr Fang

Mr Farlow

Ms Houssos

Mr Shoebridge

2. Draft minutes

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Fang: That draft minutes nos 17 and 18 be confirmed.

3. Correspondence

Committee noted the following items of correspondence:

Received:

- ***
- 18 March 2020 - Letter from the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning to the Chair, requesting for an extension to provide post hearing responses
- ***

Sent:

- ***
- 10 March 2020 - Email from secretariat to Ms Shannon Hall, Parliamentary Liaison Officer, Office of the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, attaching transcript of evidence with questions on notice highlighted and supplementary questions
- 18 March 2020 – Email from secretariat to Mr Mitchell Potts, Chief of Staff, Office of the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, attaching transcript of evidence with questions on notice highlighted and supplementary questions.

4. Inquiry into Budget Estimates 2019-2020**4.1 Answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions**

The committee noted that the following answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions were published by the committee clerk under the authorisation of the resolution establishing the Inquiry:

- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from the Hon Dr Geoff Lee MP, Minister for Skills and Tertiary Education, received 8 April 2020
- answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions from the Hon Sarah Mitchell MLC, Minister for Education and Early Childhood Learning, received 17 April 2020.

4.2 Extension for the return of post-hearing responses

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Shoebridge: That the committee grant an extension to the due date for the return of answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions for witnesses appearing at the hearing for the portfolio of Education and Early Childhood Learning to Friday 17 April 2020.

4.3 Corrections to the evidence given on 3 March 2020

Resolved, on the motion of Mrs Houssos: That:

- the second sentence of the evidence given by Mr Anthony Manning, Chief Executive, School Infrastructure NSW, on page 73 of the transcript from Education and Early Childhood Learning hearing on 3 March 2020 be corrected based on the advice from the Department of Education, as the word 'under' was incorrectly transcribed as 'over' in the proof copy of the transcript due to the noise in the background on the hearing day, and
- the corrected evidence be footnoted to reflect the reason for correction.

4.4 Consideration of Chair's draft report

The Chair submitted his draft report entitled *Budget Estimates 2019-2020*, which, having been previously circulated, was taken as being read.

Resolved, on the motion of Mr Farlow: That:

The draft report be the report of the committee and that the committee present the report to the House;

The transcripts of evidence, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, and correspondence relating to the inquiry be tabled in the House with the report;

Upon tabling, all unpublished transcripts of evidence, tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and supplementary questions, and correspondence relating to the inquiry, be published by the committee, except for those documents kept confidential by resolution of the committee;

The committee secretariat correct any typographical, grammatical and formatting errors prior to tabling;

That the report be tabled on Wednesday 20 May 2020.

5. Large number of supplementary questions

The committee discussed the large number of supplementary questions directed to the Minister for Education and Early Childhood, and noted various options that may be available to the committee for the next inquiry into budget estimates.

5. ***

6. Adjournment

The committee adjourned at 1.32 pm, *sine die*.

Shu-fang Wei
Committee Clerk